Stimulating Dialogue and Improvement in High-Impact Practices Using New NSSE Reports

Jillian Kinzie
Associate Director
Amy Ribera
Research Analyst
Indiana University
Center for Postsecondary Research

Concurrent Session presented at the Assessment Institute, Indianapolis, IN, October 28, 2013
Session Overview

‣ What is NSSE?
‣ High-impact Practices (HIP)
‣ QUICK Overview of the updated survey
‣ Feature new HIP report
‣ Highlight selected results
‣ Tips for generating discussion and action on your campus
‣ Q & A
What is NSSE?

NSSE annually gathers valid, reliable information on the extent to which students engage in and are exposed to proven educational practices that correspond to desirable learning outcomes.

- Ask students about their experiences
- Focuses on behavior: empirically confirmed effective practices
What is Student Engagement?

Student engagement is the time and energy students devote to educationally purposeful activities - practices shown to be related to desired educational outcomes.
Ok, what is Engagement?

- Challenging academic work
  - High expectations
  - Deep approaches to learning

- Quality involvement with faculty

- Enriching activities and high-impact practices
  - Active and collaborative learning
  - Powerful educational experiences

- Supportive peers, faculty, staff, campus
And, High-impact Practices?

- **Key traits**
  - Demand considerable amount of time and effort
  - Provide learning opportunities outside of the classroom
  - Require meaningful interactions with faculty members and students
  - Encourage interactions with diverse others
  - Provide frequent meaningful feedback
High Impact Activities

★ First-Year Seminars and Experiences
★ Common Intellectual Experiences
★ Learning Communities

What are some examples of HIPs at your institution?

★ Undergraduate Research
★ Diversity/Global Learning
★ Service Learning, Community-Based Learning
★ Internships
★ Capstone Courses/Projects
Why HI Ps?

Growing evidence that “high-impact practices” provide substantial educational benefits to students.

High-impact practices have been shown to be positively related to

- Persistence
- GPA
- Deep approaches to learning
- Increased student-faculty interaction
- Increases in critical thinking
- Improved writing skills
- Greater appreciation for diversity
- Higher overall student engagement

Impact is often larger for historically underserved students

HIP on NSSE

- Service learning
- Learning communities
- Research with faculty
- Study abroad
- Intern/Field Exp
- Senior culminating experience
The HIP Challenge

It is recommended to make it possible for **every student** to participate in at least two high-impact activities (Kuh, 2008). One in the first-year and one later, in the major.
QUICK OVERVIEW OF THE UPDATED SURVEY & DESIGN PROCESS
Higher education is constantly changing, and it is important for NSSE to stay relevant to the most salient issues and priorities of institutional assessment and research.
Design Principles

‣ Build on NSSE’s strengths
  • Focus on behavior & effective practice
  • Actionable information

‣ New content must…
  • Inform engagement
  • Be based in the literature
  • Be thoroughly tested
The Updated NSSE

From Benchmarks to Engagement Indicators and High-Impact Practices

**NSSE Benchmarks 2000–2012**

**Level of Academic Challenge**
- Expanded to focus on distinct dimensions of academic effort, including new topics of interest. In addition, key items on reading, writing, and study time will be reported in this theme.

**Active and Collaborative Learning**
- Modified to emphasize student-to-student collaboration. Updated diversity items from Enriching Educational Experiences have been moved here.

**Key Changes**

**Engagement Indicators**

- Higher-Order Learning
- Reflective & Integrative Learning
- Learning Strategies
- Quantitative Reasoning
  - **Theme: Academic Challenge**

- Collaborative Learning
- Discussions with Diverse Others
  - **Theme: Learning with Peers**
The Updated NSSE

From Benchmarks to Engagement Indicators and High-Impact Practices

**NSSE Benchmarks 2000–2012**

- **Student-Faculty Interaction**
- **Supportive Campus Environment**

**Key Changes**

- The updated Student-Faculty Interaction indicator is joined by a second measure about effective teaching practices.
- Expanded to focus separately on interactions with key people at the institution and perceptions of the institution’s learning environment.

**Engagement Indicators**

- **Student-Faculty Interaction**
- **Effective Teaching Practices**
  - Theme: Experiences with Faculty
- **Quality of Interactions**
- **Supportive Environment**
  - Theme: Campus Environment
The Updated NSSE

From Benchmarks to Engagement Indicators and High-Impact Practices

Key Changes

NSSE Benchmarks 2000–2012

Enriching Educational Experiences

Selected items are reported separately as High-Impact Practices. Items measuring discussions with diverse others were moved to Learning with Peers.

High-Impact Practices

- Learning Community
- Service-Learning
- Research with a Faculty Member
- Internship or Field Experience
- Study Abroad
- Culminating Senior Experience
NSSE at 13!

- What we’ve learned...
  connect engagement data to indicators of success; student behaviors; institutional improvement is possible

- Updating NSSE...
  same focus; new & refined measures; updated terminology
  - Emerging areas of interest – HIPs, quantitative reasoning, effective teaching, deep learning, topical modules
UPDATED SURVEY BRINGS NEW REPORTS
‣ Snapshot
‣ Engagement Indicators
‣ High-Impact Practices
‣ Frequencies and Statistical Comparisons
‣ Topical Module(s) and/or Consortium Reports

‣ Respondent Profile
‣ Administration Summary
‣ Selected Comparison Groups
‣ Pocket Guide Report
‣ Major Field Report
‣ Student Comments
- Snapshot
- Engagement Indicators
- **High-Impact Practices**
- Frequencies and Statistical Comparisons
- Topical Module(s) and/or Consortium Reports
- Respondent Profile
- Administration Summary
- Selected Comparison Groups
- Pocket Guide Report
- Major Field Report
- Student Comments
Questions HIP report can address

1. What are the HIP participation levels on your campus?
2. How does HIP participation rates compare to other institutions?
3. Are all students equally taking advantage of HIP on your campus?
1. Overall HIP Participation

**First-Year Students**
- NSSEville State: 10% participated in two or more HIPs, 54% participated in one HIP
- Public Research Univ: 13% participated in two or more HIPs, 43% participated in one HIP
- Large Public: 13% participated in two or more HIPs, 43% participated in one HIP
- NSSE 2013: 12% participated in two or more HIPs, 46% participated in one HIP

**Seniors**
- NSSEville State: 58% participated in two or more HIPs, 26% participated in one HIP
- Public Research Univ: 60% participated in two or more HIPs, 24% participated in one HIP
- Large Public: 58% participated in two or more HIPs, 25% participated in one HIP
- NSSE 2013: 60% participated in two or more HIPs, 24% participated in one HIP

Remember: The HIP Challenge?
Data Strategies to Motivate Audiences

- **Look at non-engagers**
  - NSSE 2013 results
    - ★ 46% of FY did not complete a HIP
    - ★ 18% of SR did not complete a HIP, and 23% only completed one

- **Room for improvement**

- **Dig down to individual items**
What do you think?

First-years
- Learning community
- Service-learning
- Research with faculty

Seniors
- Culminating experience
- Internship/Practicum
- Research with faculty
- Service-learning
- Study abroad

What percent of students on your campus participate in these HIPs?

What percent of students on your campus would you like to participate in these HIPs?
Are you surprised?

- **First-years**
  - Learning community (15%)
  - Service-learning (52%)
  - Research with faculty (5%)

- **Seniors**
  - Learning community (24%)
  - Service-learning (60%)
  - Research with faculty (23%)
  - Study abroad (13%)
  - Internship/Field experience (48%)
  - Culminating experience (45%)

Are these results surprising? promising? disappointing?
## 2. Institutional Comparisons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NSSEville State</th>
<th>Public Research Univ</th>
<th>Effect size</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>First-Year Students</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11c. Learning community</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>19 ***</td>
<td>-.25</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Service-learning</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>47 ***</td>
<td>.28</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11e. Research with faculty</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-.04</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participated in at least one</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participated in two or more</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11c. Learning community</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>56 ***</td>
<td>.15</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Service-learning</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>13 **</td>
<td>-.11</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Seniors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11c. Learning community</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>-.01</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Service-learning</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>55 ***</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11e. Research with faculty</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>24 ***</td>
<td>-.11</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11a. Internship or field exp.</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11d. Study abroad</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>13 ***</td>
<td>-.15</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11f. Culminating senior exp.</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>43 ***</td>
<td>-.10</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participated in at least one</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participated in two or more</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11c. Learning community</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>-.02</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Service-learning</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-.04</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Response Details

Research with a Faculty Member

*Which of the following have you done or do you plan to do before you graduate?*

- **NSSEville State**
  - Done or in progress: 20%
  - Plan to do: 14%
  - Have not decided: 16%
  - Do not plan to do: 50%

- **Public Research Univ**
  - Done or in progress: 24%
  - Plan to do: 14%
  - Have not decided: 15%
  - Do not plan to do: 47%

- **Large Public**
  - Done or in progress: 23%
  - Plan to do: 15%
  - Have not decided: 15%
  - Do not plan to do: 47%

- **NSSE 2013**
  - Done or in progress: 23%
  - Plan to do: 13%
  - Have not decided: 16%
  - Do not plan to do: 49%

Work with a faculty member on a research project.
3. Participation by Student Characteristics

### First-Year Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>#</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic or Latino</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian/Other Pac. Islander</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign or nonresident alien</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or more races/ethnicities</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional (FY &lt; 21, Seniors &lt; 25):</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nontraditional (FY 21+, Seniors 25+)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First-generation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not first-generation</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First-generation</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All students participating at similar rates?
Selected Results: By Demographics

- HIPs only reach a fraction of students
- Seniors researching with faculty
  - 18% Black, 24% Asian, 20% White, 18% Latino
  - 22% full-time, 11% part-time
  - 27% non-first-generation, 16% first-generation
  - 25% non-transfers, 14% transfer students
  - 26% under 24 years, 12% 24 years or older
  - Great variation by major field

(Again, note benefits can be greater for historically underserved students!)
Percent of seniors participating in HIPs in four large-enrollment majors

Results from NSSE Annual Results 2010, Major Differences: Examining Student Engagement by Field of Study
Questions to consider, cont’d

4. What are the relationships between HIP participation and selected outcomes on your campus? (grades, graduation, deep learning, etc.)

5. How can you generate interest? (for example, within majors or programs, or by pressing on results among certain student populations?)
Senior relationships, controlling for student and institution characteristics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Senior Capstone</th>
<th>Internship w/ Faculty</th>
<th>Service-Learning</th>
<th>Study Abroad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DAL Overall</td>
<td>+ +</td>
<td>+ +</td>
<td>+ + +</td>
<td>+ + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Order Learning</td>
<td>+ +</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+ +</td>
<td>+ +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrative Learning</td>
<td>+ +</td>
<td>+ +</td>
<td>+ + +</td>
<td>+ + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflective Learning</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+ +</td>
<td>+ +</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: + $p < .001$, ++ $p < .001$ and Unstd B > .2, +++ $p < .001$ and Unstd B > .4

See Kuh (2008), and NSSE Annual Results, 2007
Dig into your data: Gains, Affect

First-year relationships, controlling for student and institution characteristics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Learning Community</th>
<th>Service-Learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gains in Practical Skills</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+ +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gains in Personal/Social</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+ + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gains in General Education</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+ +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supportive Campus Environment</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+ +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Satisfaction</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: + $p<.001$, ++ $p<.001$ and Unstd B > .2, +++ $p<.001$ and Unstd B > .4

See Kuh (2008), and NSSE Annual Results, 2007
5. Generating Interest

- Orientation staff and academic advisors—how might they encourage students to consider HIPs?
- HIP offices (study abroad office, community service, res life, etc.)—how can they get extra support?
- Underrepresented student programs—how can HIPs reach more students?
- Departments—how can HIPs be integrated into disciplines?
- Faculty—how can faculty get involved?
How important is it to faculty that undergraduates do HIPs? (“very important” or “important”)

- Culminating experience (85%)
- Internship/Practicum (86%)
- Learning community (53%)
- Research with faculty (56%)
- Study abroad (44%)
Faculty Perceptions

100 FSSE-NSSE 2012 institutions

Senior Participation in High-Impact Practices

- Study Abroad: 8%
- Research w/ Faculty: 15%
- Learning Community: 28%
- Internship/ Practicum: 54%
- Culminating Experience: 32%

Colors indicate:
- Red: Faculty Importance Low
- Blue: Faculty Importance High
Faculty Time

Average Hours Per Week

- Teaching: 9.2
- Grading: 7.4
- Other feedback: 6.3
- Preparing for class: 9.1
- Reflecting on teaching: 5.0
- Research and scholarship: 8.6
- Undergraduate research: 2.7
- Advising: 4.0
- Supervising internships: 2.3
- Student committees/activities: 2.5
- Student interactions out of class: 3.7
- Service: 3.4

Results from FSSE 2012
Integrating HIPs

- How can HIPs be integrated in faculty time?
- How can courses be structured to give students a ‘taste’ of HIPs?
- How can degree requirements include HIPs?
- How might discipline shape the HIPs you integrate?
- How might multiple HIPs be integrated into one experience?

What might you do to integrate a high-impact practice into one of your courses?
Additional Resources

Online Institutional Report

- Same reports, but easy access and sharing
Additional Resources

NSSE Report Builder - Institution Version

• A secure, interactive database for participating institutions that instantly generates reports of your choosing using student and institutional characteristics
• (A public version is also available)
Examples of how NSSE, BCSSE, and FSSE data have been used to guide educational policy and practice on campuses

Snapshots of practical applications of results

Online database to search for examples of how institutions are using NSSE, BCSSE, and FSSE data

Access from NSSE homepage
Making the Most of Data – Sharing Results and Taking Action

- Think about potential audiences – *find relevancy*
- Consider various strategies for sharing results – *deliver in small doses, add narrative*
- Link to other assessment data to tell a more comprehensive story.
- Teach small groups about the data, help them use it in program review, to assess the first year experience, to inform faculty development - and then share their use with others.
- Share lessons learned, and action taken with campus constituents – *especially students.*
Final Thoughts

- Make sure HIPs are done well
  - Seven points of effective HIPs

- The state of HIP participation on campus

- Equal opportunities for all

- Connections to positive outcomes

- Generating interest
  - Faculty are key!
For More Information...

Ask us questions, let us know how things are going...

- Jillian Kinzie jikinzie@indiana.edu
- Amy Ribera akribera@indiana.edu

Copies of papers and presentations as well as annual reports and other information are available through the Web site www.nsse.iub.edu
Internal Campus Uses

- Gauge status of campus priorities
- Examine changes in student engagement between first and senior years
- Assess campus progress over time
- Encourage dialogue about good practice
- Link with other data to test hypotheses, evaluate programs
- Improve curricula, instruction, services

Diagram:
- Institutional Improvement
  - Learning Communities
  - Enrollments Management
  - 1st Year and Senior Experience
  - Academic Affairs
  - Learning Assessment
  - Faculty Development
  - Institutional Research
  - Student Affairs
  - Peer Comparison
  - Academic Advising
External Campus Uses

- Assess status vis-à-vis peers, competitors
- Identify, develop, market distinctive competencies
- Encourage collaboration in consortia (e.g., statewide NSSE conference)
- Provide evidence of accountability for good processes (while awaiting improvement in outcomes)