Capping Off the College Experience: Participation and Effects of Capstone Courses

Jillian Kinzie, Alexander McCormick & Thomas Nelson Laird, NSSE and the Indiana University Center for Postsecondary Research

AAC&U Annual Meeting 2010, Washington DC

Capping Off the College Experience

• First, an assertion: College should be a transformative experience for students
• What experiences transform?
  – High-impact practices
  – Disorienting dilemmas
  – High expectations, high challenge, etc.
• How can we construct more transforming experiences? How do we know that the practices we associate with transformation are effective?

Findings from NSSE and AAC&U

Growing evidence that “high-impact practices” provide substantial educational benefits to students

High Impact Activities

★ First-Year Seminars and Experiences
★ Common Intellectual Experiences
★ Learning Communities
★ Capstone Courses and Projects
★ Writing-Intensive Courses
★ Collaborative Assignments and Projects
★ “Science as Science Is Done”; Undergraduate Research
★ Diversity/Global Learning
★ Service Learning, Community-Based Learning
★ Internships

Audience Survey

• Does your institution offer a culminating experience?
• What is the nature of the experience?
  – Capstone project
  – Senior seminar
  – Comprehensive exam
  – Field experience/internship
  – Other?

Session Objectives

• Review research about culminating experiences
• Consider data about culminating experiences and senior capstones and how this might influence the design and sustainability of senior experiences
Culminating Experiences

Experiences in the senior year that represent the culmination of years of intellectual, professional, and personal development that prepares students to transition to the next phase in life in a career or in post-graduate work, and as member of a community.

**Forms:** Senior seminars, Capstone courses, Internships, Senior projects, Comprehensive exams, field experiences....


---

Senior Capstones

- Senior seminar/capstone course is taken near the end of a program, and may integrate or synthesize learning within the major, provide opportunities to reflect on the overall college experience, or facilitate transition to life after college.
- Courses founded early 1900s. College presidents taught courses integrating philosophy & religion
- Since its inception, the “senior seminar” has appeared and disappeared in colleges and universities throughout the United States

---

Capstone Background

- **National Survey of Senior Sem & Capstones (1999)**
  - course about culminating learning in the major
  - enrollments fewer than 30
  - treated as academic major or core requirements, most are 1 term; require a major project or presentation
- **Other studies of capstones:**
  - Carnegie Council on Policy Studies in Higher Education (1970) – examined academic catalogs for course type -- found only 3% institutions sponsored senior seminars
  - Henscheid (2000) - review suggested senior seminar/capstone courses associated with academic discipline and coordinated through academic unit

---

Types of Senior Capstone Courses

- **Discipline-and department-based.** Typical; Synthesize learning in major; Offered in academic department, required. 3 credits, letter grade. Topics vary by major; relevant to professions. Major project or presentation.
- **Interdisciplinary.** Small proportion; synthesize general education, major, and cocurricular learning. Found at private institutions, Presentations & major projects Topics broad, stress inter-relatedness of disciplines, majors.
- **Transition.** Focus on preparation for work, grad school, life after college. Faculty or career-center professionals instruct. 1 credit. Students develop portfolios.
- **Career-planning.** Assist students engage in pre-professional development. Taught by career-center professionals. Portfolios, sometimes major project, presentation.
- **Other.** Courses span curricular and co-curricular boundaries and attempt to address institutional goals.

---

Purpose of Capstone

- Integration
- Breadth
- Application
- Transition


---

Senior Capstones: One School's Debate about Alternatives

- "The capstone is this moment of students obtaining and then demonstrating intellectual independence and mastery."
  - Brian Casey, President DePauw University (Dec., 2009).
- At DePauw, two-thirds of departments provide opportunity to do individual research, and a smaller portion require it.
- "I envision an oral exam that shows ability to think, discuss and integrate what you've learned."
  - Faculty member in Philosophy
### Senior Capstone: One School’s Debate about Alternatives

- Biology professor: An interdisciplinary senior project might be intimidating to the average incoming student...
- Faculty: What is the appropriate forum by which students could showcase senior projects? "What should the appropriate closure event be? A dinner? A presentation? Getting your name published in a book?"

> “It seems that sometimes students finish their research, and only a few people will come to see a presentation and appreciate it.”

### NSSE and Culminating Experiences

NSSE Annual Survey Item 7h.

Have you done or do you plan to do before you graduate from your institution... Culminating senior experience (comprehensive exam, capstone course, thesis, project, etc.)

RESULTS:
- FY “plan to do”: 48%
- SR “done”: 33%
- SR “plan to do”: 31% (11% have not decided??)

### NSSE and Culminating Experiences

- Results similar across institutional type, except Bac LACs -- 61% “done” (FY 65% “plan to do”)
- Slightly more men have done culminating exp.
- Predictable major differences:
  - Arts & Humanities 38%
  - Biological Sciences 33%
  - Business 34%
  - Education 26%
  - Engineering 49%
  - Physical Sciences 33%
  - Professional 25%
  - Social Sciences 35%

### Senior Culminating Experiences Results 1

Seniors who participated had higher scores on NSSE’s Benchmarks of Effective Educational Practice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Completed a Senior Culminating Experience?</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Sig.*</th>
<th>Effect Size (d)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Benchmarks of Effective Educational Practice</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of Academic Challenge</td>
<td>60.6</td>
<td>55.1</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active and Collaborative Learning</td>
<td>55.7</td>
<td>45.9</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-Faculty Interaction</td>
<td>59.2</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supportive-Campus Environment</td>
<td>62.2</td>
<td>60.7</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Analyses weighted by gender, enrollment status, and institution size.  
***p<.001

### Senior Culminating Experiences Results 2

Seniors who participated had higher scores on deep approaches to learning & greater self-reported gains

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Completed a Senior Culminating Experience?</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Sig.*</th>
<th>Effect Size (d)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Deep Approaches to Learning</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Order Thinking</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>68.9</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrative Learning</td>
<td>65.6</td>
<td>56.8</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflective Learning</td>
<td>65.3</td>
<td>59.6</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-Reported Gains in Learning and Development</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gains in Practical Competence</td>
<td>72.6</td>
<td>65.6</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gains in Personal and Social Development</td>
<td>57.5</td>
<td>53.8</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gains in General Education</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>70.5</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>.29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Analyses weighted by gender, enrollment status, and institution size.  
***p<.001

### Outcomes Associated with Senior Culminating Experiences

- Deep learning: Attend to underlying meaning of information as well as content; Integrate and synthesize ideas, information; Discern patterns in evidence or phenomena; Apply knowledge in different situations; View issues from multiple perspectives
- Educational Gains:
  - General Education – Writing; speaking clearly; gen ed; critical thinking
  - Practical Competence – Working with others, solving real problems, work related knowledge
  - Personal/Social Development – understanding self; contributing to community;
NSSE Additional Questions about “High-Impact Activities”

Activities collected include:
- Learning Communities
- Service Learning
- Research with a Faculty Member
- Study Abroad
- Culminating Senior Experience
- Writing Intensive (2008)
- Senior Seminars/Capstone Courses (2009)

Today’s Presentation

- Culminating Senior Experience (2007)
- Senior Seminars/Capstone Courses (2009)

Culminating Senior Experience

- Added questions about:
  - Nature of culminating experience
  - Who worked on culminating experience
  - Required experience
  - Time dedicated
  - Clarity of Expectations
  - Supervision, Feedback
  - Contribution to abilities (Tolerating ambiguity, Working with others, Understanding how knowledge is created, Acquiring job skills, Solving complex problems, Taking intellectual risks, Speaking clearly, Writing clearly, Thinking imaginatively, Applying theory, Making judgments, Learning on my own, Understanding key concepts in major, Thinking critically, Synthesizing)

Participation in Selected Culminating Experiences

- Major paper, project, or thesis: 58%
- Capstone course in my major: 46%
- Formal presentation or demonstration: 36%
- Comprehensive exam: 29%
- Field placement or experience: 25%
- Capstone course unrelated to major: 6%

Note: Students participated in more than one activity. Column percents do not total 100%.

Culminating Senior Experience

- 50% worked alone; 40% worked with others
- 77% indicated required for graduation
- Amount of time spent per week on project varied; 34% spent 5 or fewer hours compared to 11% who devoted more than 30 hours
- 61% frequently met with faculty member supervising work; only 8% never met with faculty sponsor
- 75% said supervising faculty member clearly outlined expectations and requirements at outset

Culminating Senior Experience

- Students reported that culminating experience contributed “substantially” (quite a bit, very much) to their abilities, varies by experience
- Field placements have impact on greatest number of gains
- Also beneficial:
  - Projects that required greatest investment of time,
  - Working in groups,
  - Meeting often with supervising faculty member, and
  - Receiving clear expectations for the activity.
Senior Capstone Courses

Questions appended to 2009 NSSE annual survey:
- Nature of capstone
- Required for major
- Graded, Credits
- Length of Time
- Contribution to abilities (Thinking critically, analytically; Speaking clearly, Writing clearly and effectively; Learning effectively on own; Developing an understanding of global issues; etc.)

Senior Capstone - Data & Sample

47 Institutions
- 36% (17) Bac A & S
- 17% (8) Bac Div
- 19% (9) Masters
- 11% (5) Doc Granting
- 17% (8) Other inst
- 28% (13) Public
- Average size = 3,900

10,500 Seniors
- 36% SR capstone
- 62% women
- 29% first generation
- 69% traditional age
- 46% live on campus
- 38% transfer students
- 88% full time
- 16% Greek
- 78% White

Senior Capstone - Some Quick Facts

- 87% of those taking a senior culminating experience indicated taking a seminar or capstone course
- 84% of capstone takers took the course in their major
- 94% of capstone takers were required to take the course
- >50% of capstone takers reported gaining from the experience across a host of outcomes

Learning Gains

What learning gains should capstone most help students develop?
1. Thinking critically & analytically;
2. Speaking clearly;
3. Writing clearly and effectively;
4. Learning effectively on own;
5. Understanding of global issues;
6. Evaluating oral & written expression of others;
7. Integrating ideas from a variety of disciplines;
8. Making decisions & judgments based on evidence;
9. Making ethical choices;
10. Developing intellectual curiosity;
11. Acquiring job – work related goals;
12. Understanding relevance of major;

Percent of Students Who Reported Gaining “Quite a bit” or “Very much”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skill</th>
<th>0%</th>
<th>20%</th>
<th>40%</th>
<th>60%</th>
<th>80%</th>
<th>100%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Writing clearly and effectively</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>73%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing intellectual curiosity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>77%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning effectively on your own</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>77%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking critically and analytically</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>77%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making decisions/judgments based on evidence/reasoning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>79%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percent of Students Who Reported Gaining “Quite a bit” or “Very much”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skill</th>
<th>0%</th>
<th>20%</th>
<th>40%</th>
<th>60%</th>
<th>80%</th>
<th>100%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speaking clearly and effectively</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluating oral and written expressions of others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating ideas from a variety of academic disciplines</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding relevance of academic major</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Percent of Students Who Reported Gaining “Quite a bit” or “Very much”

- Making ethical choices: 54%
- Developing an understanding of global issues: 56%
- Acquiring job- or work-related knowledge and skills: 58%

Check In

- Does this match your assumptions about what students should gain from a senior capstone?
- Is capstone missing an opportunity to enhance a particularly important student learning outcome?

More Likely to Take SR Capstone

- > 10% participation difference
  - Traditional age students
  - Students living on campus
  - Non-transfer students
  - Full-timers
  - Greek members
  - Varsity athletes
  - Social sciences majors

Some Comparisons by Major

Percentage of Faculty Who Think Culminating Senior Experiences are Important or Very Important

- Arts & Humanities: 85%
- Biological Sciences: 84%
- Engineering & Phys Sciences: 85%
- Professional: 86%
- Social Sciences: 83%

Percentage of Seniors Participating in a Capstone

- Arts & Humanities: 42%
- Biological Sciences: 43%
- Engineering & Phys Sciences: 40%
- Professional: 32%
- Social Sciences: 52%
One more finding...

- Our data suggest a small negative relationship between the percentage of seniors participating and the institutional average gain from capstones

- What does this mean?
  - Variation in implementation?
  - Institutionalization?
  - Animosity toward required capstone?

Discussion

- What learning outcomes should we aim to develop in senior culminating experiences and capstones?
- What do these results suggest about designing and sustaining senior culminating experiences?
- Which students at your institution are less likely to experience a culminating experience? Should it be made more widespread?
- What do you know about the qualities of the capstones at your campus?
To Ponder

“We owe it to seniors to provide an opportunity to reflect, plan, bring closure and ensure a successful transition as productive citizens.”

Have students embodied the mission of the university that was frequently paraded before them at first-year orientation? Can we confidently turn our graduates loose in the community?

- John Gardner, author Senior Year Experience

Final Word: How can we ensure more students have a meaningful senior culminating experience?

Be Intentional about Exposing Students to Educationally Effective Practice